Parenting

Literature Review

Parenting in a Historical and Traditional Context

Seven recurring themes are found in the history of child rearing in the United States:

- societal debates on how best to raise children,
- good child rearing and education create better adults,
- parents seem to be eager to listen to "experts."
- expert opinions shift with each decade,
- child rearing shifts with each decade,
- society views mothers differently with each decade, and
- society debates how children should be treated (Clarke-Stewart, 1998).

Powerful cultural myths affect parents' roles and responsibilities. Many parents tend to fall into more traditional roles after they have children. Deutsch (2001) found that inequality in parenting tasks can occur in even the most "liberal" and "progressive" of families. This inequality is likely to be a direct result of a new division of labor in the family. Couples who more equally share parenting duties do so because of a strong shared ideology, a mother's desire to maintain her career, a father's lack of other compelling opportunities, and a shared commitment to parenting (Deutsch, 2001).

Etaugh and Folger (1998) studied others' perceptions of parents who tended to share equally parenting duties and found stereotypes and potential bias among the sample. A sample of college students was asked to evaluate eight parenting vignettes. Although students viewed full-time working parents as more competent, they also labeled them more stressed and less nurturing compared with parents with reduced workloads. The students specifically cited full-time working mothers as being less nurturing than full-time working fathers. Overall, however, mothers were perceived as more nurturing than fathers, no matter what their workload was.

Differing levels of involvement in children's lives is one way that couples may divide labor between them. Milkie, Bianchi, and Mattingly (2002) assessed how ideals and realities in child-rearing practices influence parental well-being. Findings revealed that more women than men feel that ideally, parents should share child rearing. In actuality, mothers are more actively involved in several dimensions—disciplining children, playing with children, providing emotional support, and monitoring children's activities. Mothers' well-being was adversely affected when fathers did not achieve the mothers' expectations.

Parent Surveys: A Reflection of Today's Parents

Two reports of parent survey research highlighted the challenges and lack of supports many of today's parents face. Farkas, Johnson, & Duffett, n.d.; Rochlizepartain, Scales, Roehlzeepartain, & Rude, 2002). Farkas et al. (n.d.) conducted 12 focus groups and telephoned a random sample of 1,607 parents of children from 5 to 17 years old. Parents were worried about harmful messages, physical dangers, and their children's television exposure. Low-income parents were particularly concerned about money, health insurance, and their children's friends. Rochlizepartain et al. (2002) conducted a national survey of 1,005 parents and found that many did not rely on family, friends, or communities when they
were in need. Parents who had strong relationships with their partners were more likely to feel good about their parenting skills, but they still wanted external recognition that they were good parents.

**Parental Relationships**

In a discussion of the complicated intersection of children’s rights, parents’ skills, and societal obligations, Westman (1999) asserted that children have a moral right to competent parenting and society has a responsibility to help parents achieve sufficient standards. Research reviewed indicates that children fare best in intact families with low-Conflict marriages (Moore, Jerielek, & Emig, 2002), and parental preoccupation with other things increases the likelihood that children will exhibit negative outcomes, including violence for males and welfare dependency for females.

Research has found that parental well-being is positively related to nurturing and supportive parenting behaviors and negatively related to long work hours and neighborhood problems associated with economic strain (Voydanoff & Donnelly, 1998).

Marital conflict is positively associated with child maladjustment and harsh discipline across race, age, and gender of parents and children. It is negatively related to parents’ involvement in their children’s lives (Buehler & Gerard, 2002). Daughters are more sensitive to marital tensions, and fathers of adolescents report greater feelings of marital stress that encourage them to withdraw from the family (Buehler & Gerard, 2002). Parents with lower socioeconomic status were also more likely to practice harsh discipline, experience greater stress, and have more negative parenting beliefs when compared with parents with higher socioeconomic status (Pinderhughes, Dodge, & Bates, 2000).

Some evidence suggests that parental stress is related to child temperament (McBride, Schoppe, & Rane, 2002) as well as to less positive perceptions of the child by the parents (Pinderhughes et al., 2000). Caring for children who are intensely emotional appears to be somewhat more stressful for fathers than mothers. One study showed that mothers were more evenly involved with children of all temperaments, which the authors interpreted as meaning they had less choice in their level of involvement (McBride et al., 2002). This interpretation may be further supported by other studies of parental involvement that indicate that mothers are more uniform in responses to indicators of parental involvement, whereas fathers have greater variability (Whiteside-Mansell, Bradley, & Rakow, 2001).

When examining both mother and father involvement with children, Manlove and Vernon-Feagans (2002) found that fathers prefer to engage with “happy” babies, and they complete more caregiving tasks with their sons. Their research also suggested that mothers spent significantly more time with their daughters but parents together spent more time with their sons.

Finally, evidence suggests that parents and children can influence each other’s behaviors. Strand (2000) found several studies that suggested that children and parents reinforce each other’s “bad” behaviors. Domitrovich and Bierman (2001) found that parents’ responses to their children were influenced by the children’s behaviors.

**Parent Supports**

A study of 1,260 rural parents found that mothers tended to seek both formal and information social support (Redmond, Spoth, & Trudeau, 2002). The study defined formal supports as professionals, such as clergy, school counselors, or mental health providers. The study defined informal social supports as casual support from friends, family, neighbors, newspapers, or magazines. The study also found that families with smaller incomes were more likely to seek formal supports.

Evidence indicates that low-income parents with many social supports are more
likely to be nurturing and positive with their children compared with parents without any social supports (Webster-Stratton, 1997). Literature is beginning to explore the importance of social supports and neighborhood engagement for families. Informal social supports are reciprocal in nature. Each member of the group is helped by and is helpful to others in their time of need. Informal support systems can have a direct and positive effect on depressive symptoms, health, and overall life satisfaction (Limber & Hashima, 2002). These networks act as a natural buffer against everyday stressors or individual stressful events. Evidence also suggests that informal social supports for the adults in families have an indirect yet positive effect on children (Jack, 2000).

Neighborhoods can be an important socializing agent for children, especially when ties are strong and the community is close. Research into urban villages shows that strong neighborhood ties are associated with children who are more socially competent, who are less depressed, and who perform better in school. Findings of urban villages vary by ethnicity and race, with African American and Hispanic American families having a larger number of extended relatives in walking distance and white families interacting more with their neighbors (Marshall, Noonan, & McCartney, 2001).

Parenting from an Ethnic or Cultural Perspective

As primary socialization agents, parents play an important role in children's development of their identity through racial socialization (Hughes, 2003). On examination of African Americans, Dominicans, and Puerto Ricans, Hughes (2003) discovered that all three racial groups were more likely to discuss elements of culture than problems of racial bias in any given year. Differences arose when Dominicans and Puerto Ricans identified with their ethnic identity stronger than African Americans even though all groups felt equally strong about socializing their children into their culture.

Cross-cultural comparisons of parenting attitudes have uncovered differences in parenting attitudes by ethnicity. Some research suggests that more Asian American and African American mothers may support corporal punishment than those in other ethnic groups (Jambunathan, Burts, & Pierce, 2000). Another study found that Chinese parents focus more on control and achievement than white parents (Kotchick & Forehand, 2002).

When training children for universal developmental tasks like toilet training, white mothers are more likely to use a child-centered approach by letting the child explore, whereas Puerto Rican mothers are more likely to use parent-guided approaches, in which the mother carefully structures learning experiences (Schulze, Harwood, Schoelmerich, & Leyendecker, 2002). Research on parental self-efficacy—parents' perception of their effectiveness in their parental role—has also demonstrated differences by ethnicity (Coleman & Karraker, 1998). For example, in literature reviewed by Coleman and Karraker (1998), other studies have found a link between lower parental self-efficacy and low income in economically stressed African American and white families. In white families, this finding was also related to depression.

Parenting Young Children

A 1995 to 1996 survey of new parents indicated that many are struggling to raise their young children and are missing key opportunities for help (Young, Davis, & Schoen, 1996). The survey of 2,017 parents of children younger than 3 found that parents feel very alone when coping with the adjustments and demands of caring for a newborn. They wanted to hear more advice from their pediatrician and wanted more encouragement from hospital staff.

Overall, the research on parenting young children suggests that parent-child interactions are crucial to the child's development. Landry, Smith, and Swank
(2001) found that children of mothers who exhibited low responsiveness showed slower rates of growth compared with children of mothers who exhibited high responsiveness. Furthermore, children whose mothers exhibited both high and low responsiveness were somewhat better off than children of mothers who always showed low responsiveness. Premature and full-term babies both benefited the most and showed the most developmental growth when cared for by highly responsive mothers.

Parent and infant interactions may also be crucial to children's social development. Fagot (1997) found that negative parent-child relationships were significantly associated with negative child-peer relationships.

Some early intervention programs have demonstrated effectiveness in enhancing parental skills. In a study of families in 20 Head Start sites, Stormshack, Kaminski, and Goodman (2002) found that home visiting by professionals coupled with participation in Head Start was associated with improved parental involvement with children. The authors' review of the literature highlighted early interventions as having a positive influence on reducing problem behaviors and enhancing social development.

**Parenting Adolescents**

Much of the research on parenting adolescents examines three dynamics:

- parents' influences on their adolescent's development,
- neighborhood influences on parents and adolescents, and
- economic influences on families.

Although a wealth of information on coping with a youth's transition to leaving home exists, the literature includes little research on helping parents through their child's transition into adolescence (Spring, Rosen, & Matheson, 2002). In a small sample of 10 families of adolescents, Spring et al. (2002) discovered that in two-parent families, spousal support was very important in working through changing relationships with maturing children. Analysis of the qualitative data collected in the study indicated that all parents in the sample shared a defining experience that made them aware of their child's maturation.

A large study of 1,227 8th- through 12th-grade adolescents and their parents by Bogenschneider, Small, and Tsay (1997) revealed that mothers who felt competent in their parenting abilities had daughters who reported good parent responsiveness. This same study found that fathers believed they were significantly more competent in parenting their sons than parenting their daughters.

When examining adult outcomes of adolescent parenting practices, research has shown that young adults whose parents supported and guided their transition out of adolescence had healthy outcomes, whereas youth whose parents were overly punitive or coercive showed signs of inhibited psychological growth (Aquilino & Supple, 2001; Barrera, Prellow, & Dumka, 2002). Findings from a two-wave study of 1,066 children found that more supportive parenting with proper control resulted in less adolescent problem behavior (Aquilino & Supple, 2001). Coercive parenting was linked to youth hostility toward adults (Aquilino & Supple, 2001).

In a study of 1,012 high school students, girls reported higher levels of parental support, social monitoring, and school monitoring than boys (Sartor & Youniss, 2002). Miller, DiFiorio, and Dudley (2002) studied the reactions of 439 youth to hypothetical conflict situations and found that adolescents with more-permissive parents were significantly more likely to choose more negative reactions to the hypothetical situations than were youth with less-permissive parents. They also found that as children became adolescents, they were more likely to choose negative outcomes to the hypothetical situations than were 11- and 12-year-olds. Aquilino and Supple (2001), however, showed that young adults with more-restrictive parents were statistically more likely to use drugs or alcohol, suggesting that a balance between
parental monitoring and relinquishment of control may be key.

Research examining genetic and environmental contributions to parent-adolescent relationships found evidence of a genetic link between parental negativity and adolescent antisocial behavior (Neiderhiser, Reiss, & Hetherington, 1999). Aquilino and Supple (2001) also found that coercive parenting led to poorer outcomes for young adults. These studies suggest two ideas:

- parents tend to monitor their girls' activities more than boys', and
- youth react more negatively without the right balance of parental authority and support.

Economics and neighborhoods can affect parent-adolescent relationships. In a study of 300 adolescents and their families, economic hardship caused parents to be less supportive of their children (Barrera et al., 2002). Researchers also found a relationship between family stress and a youth's likely association with deviant peers. Finally, Bowen, Bowen, and Ware (2002) explored potential neighborhood influences on youth development and family behaviors. This research of a nationally representative sample of 1,757 youth found that greater levels of neighborhood disorganization led youth to view their parents as less supportive. The study also suggested that after controlling for demographic characteristics, the effect of social disorganization on educational outcomes for youth could not be attributed to race or socioeconomic status. This meant that the perceived disorganization of neighborhoods and its relationship to how well or poorly adolescents performed in school had nothing to do with the youth’s race or whether he or she lived in poverty. In the end, Bowen et al. called for more research on adolescent functioning in neighborhoods, given their own research and a review of the literature that seemed to suggest that neighborhood values, social relationships, and a perception of shared goals can affect adolescent outcomes.

Parent Training

Evidence exists that some types of parent training can help parents do a better job. Several different types of parent training exist, such as models designed for parents who just want additional information to be sure they are doing the best job they can, and models that address specific needs, such as families experiencing child behavior problems or families in which child maltreatment is a concern.

According to Bavolek (2002), parenting runs along two continuums: abusive and nurturing. One can equate higher incidence of nurturing with less incidence of abuse because the two behaviors are mutually exclusive. Nurturing parents are supportive of their children, set boundaries, and have appropriate expectations. Abusive parents may expect too much from their children. They may lack empathy, value physical punishment, and be unaware of their children's appropriate developmental levels.

Evidence shows that children who experience maltreatment are at greater risk for adverse health effects and risky health behaviors when they reach adulthood (Centers for Disease Control and Prevention, 2004). Caseworkers understand, however, that many parents involved in the child welfare system do not intentionally harm their children; rather their lack of knowledge, skills, or resources has led them to harm their children (Price & Wichterman, 2003).

When examining common elements in successful parent training programs, a review of the literature shows that effective programs involve the whole family (Kumpfer, 1999) and target individually identified needs (Corcoran, 2000). They are also multifaceted (Corcoran, 2000; Dore & Lee, 1999; Layzer, Goodson, Bernstein, & Price, 2001):

- use a cognitive-behavioral approach,
- provide developmental information,
- correct parents' negative interpretations of children's behaviors,
have a problem-solving focus,
provide for active participation,
include anger and stress management, and
offer both in-home and group components.

Effective Means of Parent Training Delivery

Agencies may deliver parent training to families in a variety of ways. Models may provide for group sessions, home visiting, or computer-based delivery. Although less used, one model provides temporary foster care for the entire family to give parents an opportunity to be mentored directly by experienced foster parents.

Research from programs such as Bavolek’s (2002) Nurturing Parent Program and Parenting Wisely show positive results from parents participating in group sessions. This may indicate that parents readily identify with others in the group and are able to place their own issues in perspective with others. Parents experience less stigma because they are not alone or the only ones with stressors and problems. Group training can satisfy individuals’ needs for recognition, security, and affiliation—all leading parents to the conclusion that “they are not alone” (Garvin, Gutierrez, & Galinsky, 2004).

Some of the oldest research on parent training was on home visiting models such as the Prenatal/Early Infancy Project, an Elmira, New York, home visiting program (Karoly, Kilburn, Bigelow, Caulkins, & Cannon, 2001). The program was designed for at-risk pregnant women and first-time mothers. The nurses worked with the new families through the child’s 2nd birthday. The researchers recruited treatment ($n = 116$) and control groups ($n = 184$) between 1978 and 1980. They followed these families through the firstborn child’s 15th birthday. Benefits for intervention mothers included improved prenatal behaviors, less child abuse, lower welfare use, and decreased criminal behavior. Children showed several benefits as well.

Parents as Teachers compiled research on their parent-training program and found that home visiting coupled with school readiness for children has shown significantly positive results for low-income children on school entry (Pfannenstiel, Seitz, & Zigler, 2002). The research also showed improvements in parents’ interactions with their children.

Parenting Wisely is a CD-ROM-based parenting program that has several versions designed for different parenting needs. Developers of Parenting Wisely drew from educational research that has demonstrated the effectiveness of video and interactive video (computer-assisted) technology in teaching. The parent and child behaviors depicted in the program are based on a review of psychology literature as well as the developers’ experience as family therapists. Computer-based administration eliminates the problems related to training of staff and consistency of delivery other evidence-based models often encounter. Less reliance on personnel for service delivery can also minimize cost and time constraints on program dissemination (Gordon, 2000).

Shared Family Care is a program that places entire families in “foster care” together (Price & Wichterman, 2003). The program moves families into a home with a mentor who guides the entire family through a program tailored to meet its unique needs. This program is most readily identified as one used for adolescent mothers and their young children. The mentor does not care for the children in the home, but acts as a guide and support for the mother. The mentor teaches the mothers to cook nutritious meals, interact positively with their children, create and maintain a budget, and explore ways to more appropriately discipline and respond to children’s behaviors. Due to resource issues, Shared Family Care is often only available to a family for six months. Staff recognize that families cannot always solve their issues in this given time period, however; therefore, the program has built in six months of aftercare with case management, support,
and housing assistance, if needed. Evaluations of Shared Family Care projects in California and Colorado found that out of 49 graduating families, 71% were moving into independent housing, compared with 13% living independently before program participation. At the end of the program, the average monthly earnings of client families doubled. This increase was due to either more post-participation employment or public assistance. Data available from the California sites indicated that most families who completed the program had no further contact with child protective services.

**Benefits of Parent Training**

Research suggests that families may derive multiple benefits from effective parent training. Parents benefit directly through the development of new skills that can lead to increased confidence, insight, and self-esteem (Adams, 2001), and children receive indirect benefits through their parents' modified behaviors.

Studies of the STAR Parenting Program (Stop, Think, Act, Respond) found that parents responded positively and showed a significant reduction in severe discipline ($p < .001$) and reductions in parent-child dysfunctional relationship ($p < .01$; Nicholoson, Anderson, Fox, & Brenner, 2002). In their observations of the program, the authors noted that for programs for high-risk families to be successful, they must be adaptable and flexible by offering parents make-up opportunities and giving them constant encouragement.

A number of parent-training models have been designed to aid parents whose children display behavioral problems. An example is Parent-Child Interaction Therapy, which researchers have evaluated several times with positive findings. The model targets parents of children ages 3 to 9 who exhibit externalizing behaviors (e.g., aggressive, oppositional). The program has yielded significant short-term improvements in child behaviors by offering parents training in obtaining compliance and play therapy (Nixon, 2002). One study showed that improvements in child behaviors were maintained through one year, but by the 18-month follow-up, many children had reverted back to old behaviors (Funderburk et al., 1998, as cited in Nixon, 2002). This may be an indication that the use of compliance and play therapy activities must continue well after children show improvement.

**Featured Programs**

**Parenting Wisely**

Parenting Wisely is an innovative approach to helping parents that faculty and graduate students in the Ohio University Department of Psychology developed. The program makes use of technology to address barriers that often keep parents in at-risk families from getting the help they need. Parents may resist attending parenting classes or group sessions because they are embarrassed that they need help. Lack of transportation and work schedules can also make such interventions hard to access. Even when parent education is provided in private sessions with a therapist, parents' fears of being judged can make them defensive and resistant to change.

Parenting Wisely is offered via an interactive CD-ROM or videotape that parents and children can use in their own homes, in a neutral setting such as a library or community center, at social service agencies, or in a group session. The entire program takes about three hours, but families can view it in segments. It is written at a fifth-grade level with an option to have material read aloud by the computer. Programs are also available in Spanish. Designers created versions for families of both younger children and adolescents, and for foster parents and residential care providers. Segments are designed for viewing individually by parents and children and by the family together. Each family receives a workbook that provides practice exercises. All versions of Parenting Wisely include a series of scenarios depicting common problems encountered by parents and several possible ways of responding.
Parents select a response, and the program then identifies and explains the best alternative.

Parenting Wisely has been tested with a variety of groups in different settings. The model’s versatility and its record of effectiveness in preventing the onset or escalation of substance abuse in at-risk youth have earned it a designation as one of the model programs featured by the U.S. Substance Abuse and Mental Health Services Administration’s Center for Substance Abuse Prevention (2002). A national review of effective family strengthening programs conducted by the U.S. Department of Justice, Office of Juvenile Justice and Delinquency Prevention, also identified the version of Parenting Wisely designed for families of adolescents as an exemplary program (Kumpfer & Alvarado, 1998).

Researchers tested the model with 153 outpatients at a Massachusetts community mental health center (Caldwell, 2001). On a five-point scale, with five being the most favorable response, participants gave average ratings of 4.55 for ease of understanding, 4.53 for the program’s utility, and 4.31 for the relevance of the problems depicted in the video. Measures taken from 48% of the participants three months later and from 61% after six months showed an increase in items indicative of parent-child bonding. Some parents who were participating in parenting groups at follow-up indicated that their positive experience with Parenting Wisely had made them more receptive to such intervention. In fact, 40% of parents who initially refused to attend parenting classes did so after completing the Parenting Wisely program individually.

Family Plus, an Iowa program designed to strengthen families of middle-school students as a means of preventing high-risk adolescent behavior, especially drug use, used the Parenting Wisely video in a group format. Families attended three 2.5-hour sessions in which parents and youth viewed and discussed the videos and the youth received counseling and education about substance abuse. Responses from 29 families on measures of family functioning showed significant improvement at two to three weeks following completion of the intervention. The degree of substance use among the adolescents in the sample did not change. Both parents and youth expressed a desire for more than three group sessions (Hein & Martin, 2002).

Randomized, controlled studies have demonstrated the model’s effectiveness with other populations, including teen parents (Lagges & Gordon, 1997) and families of adolescents in rural Appalachia (Kacir & Gordon, 1999). A study of 80 parents of youth involved with the juvenile court showed that court-mandated participants also benefited significantly at both program completion and follow-up through six months (Gordon & Kacir, 1997).

Although the effectiveness of the video disk or CD-ROM delivery of Parenting Wisely has been supported in the above-mentioned and other research, some evidence suggests that agencies may obtain even stronger effects through the addition of group discussion. A study conducted in British Columbia compared outcomes from parents of 61 children with multiple behavior problems who were being served by a community mental health center (Pushak & Pretty, 2003). Researchers divided participants into two groups, one consisting of families that used the program individually along with one to four sessions with a therapist and another in which it was offered and discussed in a group format. Postintervention measures of children’s problem behaviors showed a 25% decrease for those who used the program individually and a 39% decrease for children of the group participants. Both groups showed maintenance of or additional improvements one year later.

Parenting Wisely is distributed by Family Works, Inc., of Athens, Ohio. For more information, contact the organization at http://www.parentingwisely.com or at 866/234-WISE.
Parents as Teachers

Parents as Teachers (PAT) is an early childhood parent education and family support program serving families throughout pregnancy and until children enter kindergarten. The program is designed to enhance child development and school achievement through parent education. Recognizing that all families can benefit from support, PAT families represent the continuum of socioeconomic levels.

The PAT National Center, Inc., develops curricula, trains early childhood professionals, and certifies parent educators to provide parents with parenting support and information on their developing child. Program goals include:

- increasing parent knowledge of early childhood development,
- improving parenting practices,
- providing early detection of developmental delays and health issues,
- preventing child abuse and neglect, and
- increasing children’s school readiness and school success.

The delivery of PAT includes home visits by certified parent educators, parent group meetings to foster informal support networks, periodic developmental screenings, and referrals to community services.

Over the past 20 years, researchers have conducted 13 outcome studies on the PAT program. When combined, these studies have yielded data on 7,937 children and 8,038 parents/guardians (Future Research, 2003). Seven of these studies examined children and families labeled “at risk.” Overall, these studies show that PAT enhances children’s school success, showing greater improvements for low-income families compared with non-low-income families.

In 1998, as part of a statewide school entry assessment, Missouri commissioned a study to measure school readiness of children as they entered kindergarten (Pfannenstiel, 1999). Researchers evaluated a sample of 3,500 kindergarten children from randomly selected elementary schools using a school entry profile. The study found that:

- When PAT is combined with any other prekindergarten experience for high-poverty children, the children score above average on all scales when they enter kindergarten.
- The highest performing children participate in PAT along with preschool or center care. Among children who participate in PAT and attend preschool, both white children and children of color score above average. Children in both high-poverty and low-poverty schools who participate in PAT and attend preschool score above average when they enter kindergarten.
- Among children whose care and education are solely home based, those whose families participate in PAT score at average and above average levels of performance on all scales.

Results based on further analysis of a subset of 2,375 children from this study were published in 2002 (Pfannenstiel et al., 2002). The strongest finding that emerged from this analysis was that the school readiness scores of children in high-poverty schools who participated in PAT were equivalent to those of children at low-poverty schools with no preschool enrichment (PAT or preschool).

Researchers conducted a multisite evaluation of PAT to assess program success with low-income parents and children (Wagner, Spiker, & Linn, 2002). They randomly assigned families with a child younger than 8 months of age to treatment (n = 275) and control (n = 390) groups. Results showed strong improved parent knowledge among families with the lowest incomes; however, no significant change in parent knowledge occurred among median-income families. This suggests that low-income parents may be generally less informed about parenting practices and
therefore may benefit significantly from parent training.

The evaluation also showed that children (evaluated through their 2nd birthday) from low-income homes showed only some improvement developmentally. This is consistent with other studies, which have found more immediate gains for parents in parent-training programs, but less for children. These studies have also shown that long-term outcomes for children are significantly improved even though these results are not immediately apparent (Karoly et al., 2001; Reynolds & Robertson, 2003). In most cases, significant positive outcomes for children appear 5 to 10 years later, when they are compared with peers whose parents did not participate in a parent-training program. Program evaluations indicate that PAT may also fall into this category. What is important about the immediate outcomes in this study was the positive effect on parents with the lowest incomes.

At one site, researchers evaluated children through their 3rd birthday and compared the effects of PAT on teen mothers and older mothers, and they found that teen mothers showed greater improvement in knowledge of discipline (effect size [ES] = .41) and were more likely to report being “very happy” in the previous year of taking care of their child (ES = .54; Wagner, Iida, & Spiker, 2001). Teen mothers in the treatment group also improved their efforts in reading aloud to their child (ES = .91), involving themselves in their child’s life (ES = .64), and organizing their home environment in a more-appropriate way (ES = .53). Overall, when compared with older mothers, PAT had a stronger, positive effect on teen mothers’ behaviors. This in turn showed stronger, positive effects for the children of teenage mothers.

For more information contact the organization at http://www.patnc.org or 866/728-4968.

**Nurturing Parenting Program**

Through a 1979 National Institute of Mental Health grant, Dr. Stephen Bavolek developed the Nurturing Parenting programs. These programs are designed to build nurturing skills in families at risk of maltreating or who have already maltreated their children. The programs are based on a theory that family-centered programs can break the generational cycle of child abuse, reduce juvenile delinquency, lower the rate of child abuse recidivism, and reduce adolescent pregnancy.

Nurturing Parenting programs are grounded in six assumptions:

- the family is a system,
- empathy is the single most desirable quality in nurturing parenting,
- parenting exists on a continuum,
- learning is both cognitive (knowledge) and affective (feeling),
- children who feel good about themselves are more likely to become nurturing parents, and
- no one prefers abusive actions.

The program is designed to treat five maltreating parent constructs:

- inappropriate parental expectations of the child,
- inability of the parent to be empathetically aware of the child’s needs,
- strong parental belief in the value of punishment,
- role reversal (inappropriately expecting children to behave like adults or conversely parents acting like children), and
- oppressing children’s power and independence.

Bavolek designed 17 different Nurturing Parenting programs based on age,
culture, and need. Programs encompass families with infants, school-age children, and teenagers; Hispanic, Southeast Asian, and African American cultures; and special learning needs or families in alcohol recovery. Parents and children attend separate, concurrent group sessions that run for 1.5 to 3 hours once a week for 7 to 48 weeks. Agencies can implement programs in a group format or in the home.

The home-based program includes 1.5-hour weekly sessions. The first 45 minutes are devoted to working with the entire family, and the remaining 45 minutes are dedicated to working with the parents. Workers encourage parents to take leadership roles in the sessions. The center-based program also occurs weekly, with parents and their children attending separate but concurrent sessions. After the group sessions, the parents and children come together to share a meal and continue to build their nurturing and family cohesion skills.

The initial Nurturing Parenting program was designed for families with children 4 to 12 years of age, and the researcher field tested it in Illinois, Indiana, Minnesota, Ohio, Pennsylvania, and Wisconsin (Bavolek, 2002). The researcher delivered several assessments to parents and children at pretest, posttest, and 12- and 18-month follow-ups. Of the 121 adults who participated in the study, 95 completed the program, and of the initial 150 children, 125 completed it. Program trainers rated 88 of the parents who completed the program as having successfully modified their parenting behaviors.

Assessments indicated that parents significantly changed their parenting and child-rearing attitudes on program completion (p < .05). These changes included having more appropriate developmental expectations, increased empathy toward children’s needs, decreased use of corporal punishment, and decreased use of role reversal. Data collected one year later showed that many of these changes were still in effect.

In an assessment of children’s views of their parents, posttest data indicated a significant (p < .05) change in children’s self-awareness and understanding of appropriate child-parent roles. At the one-year follow-up, children maintained their levels of self-awareness (p < .05) and showed a decrease in approval for corporal punishment (p < .01). A posttest measure of personality characteristics of participant children indicated significant increased in assertiveness (p < .05), enthusiasm (p < .01), and tough demeanor (p < .03).

An examination of family interaction patterns identified several significant improvements at posttest, including family cohesion (p < .03), family expressiveness (p < .03), and family independence (p < .01), whereas family conflict significantly decreased (p < .01). At the one-year follow-up, improvements were still evident.

In a comparison of program completers with program dropouts, the researcher found that parents who dropped out were more likely to be suspicious, anxious, and frustrated. Their families were also less independent and organized compared with families who completed the program.

Bavolek (2002) also evaluated the Nurturing Parenting programs for Head Start children and their families in seven counties in Wisconsin in 1984 and 1985. The study included 260 adults with children in either home-based or center-based Head Start programs. Data collected at posttest from 171 parents who completed the program indicated that parents showed a significant increase in empathetic awareness of their children’s needs, increased knowledge of appropriate expectations, and increased knowledge of alternatives for physical punishment (p < .05). Parents also showed a significant positive change in their views regarding the value of corporal punishment (p < .05). On a four-point scale designed to measure feelings toward the program, parents felt that the program had a positive effect on their roles as parents, and they also felt strongly about the program’s positive effect on their children’s growth and development. Of the parents, 97% indicated
that they would recommend Nurturing Parenting to other parents.

In 2001, Cowen published the results from an evaluation of Nurturing Parenting’s effectiveness in Iowa. From an original sample of 600 families, 191 completed all pre- and posttest forms to be included in the data set. At posttest, parents showed significant ($p < .0001$) improvements in developmentally appropriate expectations of their children, increased empathy, decreased belief in corporal punishment, and decreased use of role reversal. These improvements highlighted the parents growing understanding of their children’s needs and a willingness on the part of the parents to play an active role in helping children develop appropriately.

The Nurturing Parenting programs cost ranges from $1,000 to $2,000 depending on the program. Additional costs include agency staff time, snacks, and activities (e.g., art supplies for children).

For more information, contact the organization at http://www.nurturingparenting.com or at 800/688-5822.

Confident Parenting Program

In the early 1970s, a behavioral psychologist and his colleagues developed the Confident Parenting program for use as a prevention and treatment program in the child mental health field. The Center for the Improvement of Child Caring (CICC) adopted the program for use in parenting skill building.

The Confident Parenting program is grounded in the research literature, and its main goal is to teach parents to reinforce their child’s prosocial behaviors while redirecting deviant behaviors. The program concentrates on the “development and systematic evaluation of methods that are objective, replicable, and efficient” (see http://www.ciccparenting.org/cicc_Cpolesc_311.asp).

Initially, the designers developed the Confident Parenting program for child mental health settings, but through the CICC’s national dissemination of the program, it is now used in other settings. Currently, child protective service workers use the program with abusive parents. Early childhood educators use it in school readiness and faith-based parenting programs. The program is delivered in 10 two-hour sessions for small groups or in one-day seminars for large groups.

The program teaches parents how to use behavior-specific praise, mild social disapproval, time outs, ignoring, and special incentives. The one-day seminar also includes brief presentations on the confident parenting approach, family rules strategy, and a thinking parent’s strategy.

In the 1970s, researchers conducted several studies on the Confident Parenting program in a community mental health center in California. Families who were referred to an outpatient child psychiatric client due to child behavioral problems were included in the Confident Parenting program immediately or were waitlisted for the next class. The original study conducted from 1971 to 1975 included 392 parents and 446 children. Results showed that:

- Charging a refundable class fee increased parent attendance from 30% to 75%.
- Holding classes in housing projects with indigenous, Spanish-speaking instructors increased Mexican American parents’ attendance and participation.
- At posttest, parents showed a 61% increase in knowledge of social learning principles and behavior intervention.
- If success was defined as 30% or more change in desired direction, 62% of parents reached success. Home visits verified parent reports.
- Parents who did not complete the intervention were more likely to have been court ordered into the program and avoided active participation.
- Cost-benefit analysis showed that group training of parents was 20 times less expensive than traditional child psychiatric treatments.
Follow-up interviews showed that at six months, 52% of parents, out of 73% of the original sample, were still using learned behavior modification techniques; at 12 months, 47% of 42% of original sample; and at 24 months, 39% of 23% of original sample.

More than 90% of parents liked the program, felt it helped them manage their child’s issues, and would recommend it to a friend.

Researchers have also evaluated the Confident Parenting program with other communities. In the late 1970s and early 1980s, researchers tested the program’s effectiveness with parents of learning disabled children and low-income Latino and African American parents of preschool children.

In a study of two separate parenting programs for parents of learning disabled children, plus a control group, the Confident Parenting program showed significant positive effects on perceived changes in parent-child and spousal relationships. Parents reported improved acceptance of their children and showed a decrease in reported aggressive/hostile rejection of their children at posttest. Children reported more parental warmth at posttest. The children also showed improvements in self-concept, and their parents perceived them as more social. Teachers rated the children as less aggressive and inhibited. Overall, parent attendance was significantly related to parents’ perceptions of warmth ($p < .01$), estimates of improved spousal relationships ($p < .01$), and estimates of improved relationships with their learning disabled child ($p < .01$).

A study was conducted with low-income, nonwhite parents in a community in Los Angeles, CA. The researchers evaluated the effectiveness of three parenting programs and a control group and found that the Confident Parenting program produced stronger results for parents and their preschool-age children. The sample consisted of parents and their children who were enrolled in a Los Angeles Head Start program. Parent attendance at classes was a major problem—only 7% of parents attended all training sessions. At the follow-up, more Mexican American parents were available for data collection than African American parents.

Mexican American parents showed marked improvements in their relationships with their children. They found their children to be better behaved, and they were less likely to physically punish their children than before program participation. The researchers also found a correlation between attendance at parent training sessions and parental self-esteem. At the follow-up, parents reported increased use of nonforceful methods of punishment and reported less child aggression, antisocial behavior, and school disturbance.

For African American parents, a relationship existed between attendance at program sessions and self-esteem. This relationship was apparent at the immediate follow-up and the eight-month follow-up. No significant differences existed in child behavior at pretest and posttest. The researchers did find relationships, however, between program attendance and child behavior problems at posttest. This may have indicated that program participation was necessary for parents to highlight and improve their children’s behaviors.

Overall, African American parents reported positive changes in their relationships with their children at posttest; however, these positive changes did not hold through all follow-up assessments. Nonetheless, parents did note greater peace in their homes and more cooperation by their children. Finally, African American parents reported a decreased use of physical punishment at posttest and in subsequent follow-ups.

CICC, although satisfied that the Confident Parenting program worked for African American and Latino families to some degree, determined that more in-depth research was needed on what works for these types of families. Therefore, after extensive research, CICC created the...
Effective Black Parenting program and the Los Ninos Bien Educados (LNBE) program.

CICC created the Effective Black Parenting Program (EBPP) by evaluating historical trends in African American parenting and folding in the Confident Parenting program model. EBPP trains parents to enhance the quality of their relationship with their children and to employ strategies for raising prosocial, competent, healthy children. The program also espouses the idea that strong parenting programs must respect and honor culture. CICC added substantial African American program content to EBPP, including the Pyramid of Success for Black Children, curriculum about traditional African American discipline versus modern African American self-discipline, and strategies for helping children cope with racism and express pride in heritage.

National dissemination of EBPP began in 1988 for African American parents of children from birth to age 18. EBPP consists of 14 three-hour training sessions for 8 to 20 parents and includes a graduation ceremony. Researchers conducted an evaluation of EBPP from 1985 to 1988 using two cohorts. Cohort 1 consisted of 28 control group families and 64 treatment group families. Cohort 2 included 36 control group families and 45 treatment group families. Findings highlighted a reduction in parental rejection, an increase in positive parenting practices, improvements in family relationships, and reductions in delinquent and antisocial behaviors in children for families in the treatment groups. Most changes held at the one-year follow-up.

Similar to issues that needed to be addressed in the African American community, CICC recognized the lack of programming for Latino parents that addressed their cultural traditions and values. CICC developed LNBE as a parent education tool exclusively for Latino families. Like EBPP, LNBE was folded into the Confident Parenting program model. LNBE focused on raising children with values for academic excellence and familial respect. The designers added program-specific content for Latino families around acculturation, traditional and gender roles, and what is considered proper and improper parenting in the United State.

The program was originally designed for use with parents of 2- to 12-year-old children, but CICC has found it effective for Latino adolescent parents and for parents of children from birth to age 18. LNBE features 12 three-hour classes plus a graduation ceremony and can also be taught as a one-day seminar. In the mid-1980s, researchers conducted an evaluation of LNBE with a sample of 58 parents, 36 of whom attended eight or more classes. Nine parents were unable to attend any sessions, and the researchers used them as a comparison group. Results from a retrospective study found that parents attributed their child’s improved behaviors to their own improved parenting skills. Parents also stated that their relationships with their young children had improved markedly.

From 2001 to 2004, CICC conducted more research on LNBE as it was used in Los Angeles County, CA. The sample consisted of 293 parents who participated in the 12 classes, and 858 parents who participated in the one-day seminar, all of whom completed completed pretests and posttests.

When the researchers collapsed the data, they found that parents who participated in either the classes or the one-day seminar were significantly more likely to have a broader appreciation for child development, a fuller understanding of effective and ineffective parenting practices, and a stronger appreciation for the application of specific parenting methods. Most of these findings were significant at \( p < .01 \) or \( p < .001 \). Follow-up focus groups found LNBE to be culturally sensitive and salient.

In 2000, researchers compiled data on the use of the Confident Parenting program one-day seminar. Ninety-nine parents attended the seminar, and 80 completed pretest and posttest assessments. Evaluation showed a statistically significant
improvement ($p < .001$) from pretest to posttest, including an understanding that children’s behaviors are learned, not inherited; a greater understanding of positive feedback; and new respect for nonviolent discipline.

The Confident Parenting program offers a three-day instructor training. The training fee is $600, which includes professionally led training, certification, and $242 for the instructor’s kit. The actual program costs will vary depending on the site and include such things as refreshments, child care, space, advertising, and so forth. Parent handbooks are $11. EBPP and LNBE instructor training are five-day workshops that cost $925, which includes professionally led training, certification, and the instructor’s kit valued at $415 for EBPP and $425 for LNBE. Parent handbooks cost $19, and a parent’s guide is $15. Professionals who enroll in these programs can receive continuing education credits. Currently, CICC has trained and certified more than 6,000 parenting instructors from 44 states.

For more information contact the organization at http://www.ciccpparenting.org or 818/980-0903.

Implications for the Field

Each program featured in this Roundup offers parents, agencies, and other organizations options in working toward more successful parent-child relationships. In addition to the findings of effectiveness described previously, each model has identified specific ways parents and communities benefit from the intervention.

Program Effects on Parents and Children

In a program like Parenting Wisely, which combines CD-ROM training with other parent training, a combination of brevity; unassisted use, which lowers defensiveness; and a high amount of interaction with the program itself accounts for parent and child behavioral changes.

A powerful relationship between parent educators and parents or other primary caregivers is the strongest component in the PAT program. PAT emphasizes engagement and relationship building.

Nurturing Parenting program staff believe the program components that have the most powerful effects on families are the incorporation of the entire family in the process and a philosophy of re-parenting that challenges old habits and replaces them with new behaviors steeped in nurturance and family togetherness.

For CICC, the greatest effect of their programs on families can be felt in their cultural adaptations. Families feel honored and respected, and parents feel as if the program was designed especially for them. Parents develop a keen sense of ownership, which ultimately increases their desire to use the concepts and skills they are taught.

Program Effects on Communities

Parenting Wisely has seen parents in communities become more interested in parent education or family interventions and actively seek these services. Interest in Parenting Wisely has grown through word of mouth in communities. After participation in the program, communities see a decrease in child problem behavior in schools as well as in neighborhoods. Parent communication with other parents has also increased.

For younger children involved in PAT, communities report that the program increases children’s school readiness and later school success. The most successful PAT programs build relationships between families and the larger community, especially the schools. PAT also engages parents very early in their child’s development and education and has been found to effectively increase parental involvement when children reach school age.

Nurturing Parenting programs have seen a rise in the use of nurturing throughout the country. In many communities, the philosophy of nurturing has become a central theme of parenting. Some states and
schools, as well as the Army and Navy, are developing their own nurturing programs based on the Nurturing Parenting program model.

CICC has found that its cultural adaptations of the Confident Parenting program have provided participants with a vehicle in which to advance their people as a group. Program instructors are from the participants’ cultures, and parents considered them role models and community leaders.

About the Authors
Carrie McVicker Seth is a former Child Welfare League of America (CWLA) Research Analyst. With contributions by Marie Edwards, former CWLA intern; Sarah Kaye, former CWLA intern; and Sue Steib, Director of CWLA’s Research to Practice.

Moving from Research to Practice
R2P encourages practitioners and agencies to make critical practice changes that reflect promising strategies and research findings featured in this Roundup. CWLA can provide comprehensive consultation on practice planning and implementation that can improve your agency’s workforce status. Assistance is also available in establishing an evaluation component for existing programs or practices. R2P welcomes inquiries or information about your successful efforts to improve the child welfare workforce or other child welfare-related issues. Please send them to r2p@cwla.org.

For additional information about the R2P Initiative, visit www.cwla.org/programs/r2p. To further your understanding of CWLA’s Workforce Initiative, visit www.cwla.org/programs/trleschman.

References


